

**PENNSYLVANIA  
DEPARTMENT OF AGING**

# LONG-TERM CARE COUNCIL

EST. 2015

## Meeting Minutes

<b>Meeting:</b>	Pennsylvania Long-Term Care Council
<b>Date:</b>	Thursday, October 19, 2017
<b>Start &amp; End Time:</b>	10:00 a.m. to 2:40 p.m.
<b>Location:</b>	Pennsylvania Farm Show Complex & Expo Center, Keystone Conference Center

### Council Members in Attendance

Acting Insur. Cmmr. Jessica Altman (Designee: Alison Beam)*	Brian Hudson, Sr. (Designee: Gelene Nason)*	Acting Sec. of Human Svcs. Teresa Miller (Designee: Dep. Sec. Jen Burnett)*
Sen. Michele Brooks (Designee: Chloe Zittle, Esq.)*	Kathleen Kleinmann - <i>LTSS Consumer</i>	Dr. David Nace - <i>LTSS Physician</i>
Brig. Gen. Anthony Carrelli (Designee: Andrew Ruscavage)*	Commissioner Ted Kopas - <i>County Commissioners Association of PA</i>	Shane Nugent - <i>For-Profit SNFs</i>
Representative Pam DeLissio (Designee: Lauren Rooney)*	Ray Landis - <i>Consumer Advocacy</i>	Sec. of Aging Teresa Osborne, <i>Council Chair</i>
Lynn Fields Harris - <i>Senior Community Centers**</i>	Holly Lange - <i>Area Agencies on Aging</i>	Nicole Pruitt - <i>Adult Day Centers</i>
Sen. Art Haywood (Designee: Liana Walters, Esq.)*	Acting Sec. of Health Dr. Rachel Levine (Designee: Lori Howe-Gutierrez)*	Sec. of Transp. Leslie Richards (Designee: Emma Lowe)*
Rep. Tim Hennessey (Designee: Erin Raub)*	Robert Marino - <i>Caregiver</i>	Matt Yarnell - <i>Consumer Advocacy</i>
Anne Henry - <i>Nonprofit SNFs</i>	Joyce McClary - <i>LTSS Nurse</i>	Heshie Zinman - <i>Consumer Advocacy</i>
Lydia Hernandez-Velez - <i>Consumer Advocacy</i>	Diane Menio - <i>Caregiver</i>	

\*Attended on member's behalf

\*\*Participated in Council meeting via teleconference

### Council Members Not in Attendance

Joan Bradbury, <i>LTC Managed Care</i>	Thomas Lilly, JD, CLU - <i>LTSS Insurance</i>
Dr. Mario Cornacchione - <i>Academic Research</i>	Vini Portzline - <i>LTSS Consumer</i>
Tim Coughlin - <i>Assisted Living</i>	Kenneth Potter, Esq. - <i>PA Bar Association, Elder Law Section</i>
Dr. Jason Karlawish - <i>Academic Research</i>	Mike Sokoloski - <i>Homecare</i>
John Kordish** - <i>PA Council on Aging</i>	

### PDA Staff in Attendance

Teresa Osborne, Secretary	David Toth, Legislative Director
Terry Barley, Deputy Secretary	Chuck Quinnan, Council Executive Director
Debee Ethridge, Clerical Support	Sasha Santana, Executive Secretary
Abby Fox, Community Liaison	

### Committee Members & Guests in Attendance

Cmdt. Rich Adams, Dept. of Military & Vets Affrs (DMVA) <b>WC</b>	Cmdt. James Miller, DMVA <b>QC</b>
Tom Atkins, Pennswood Village <b>OC</b>	Cmdt. Deborah Nesbella, DMVA <b>WC</b>
Norris Benns, PA Health & Wellness	Laura Ness, Bayada Home Health Care <b>WC</b>
Cmdt. Rohan Blackwood, DMVA <b>QC</b>	Cmdt. Peter Ojeda, DMVA <b>QC</b>
Sandra Curlee, Long Term Care Insurance Specialist <b>AC</b>	Cmdt. Barbara Raymond, DMVA <b>WC</b>
Art DiLoreto, PA Association of Area Agencies on Aging <b>WC</b>	Mark J. Rosenstein, Stevens & Lee

Heather Hallman, PA Department of Human Services	Zach Shamberg, PA Health Care Association <b>WC</b>
Maria Maletta Hastie, LIFE Geisinger <b>OC</b>	Steve Touzell, Phila. Corporation for Aging <b>AC</b>
Vicki Hoak, PA Homecare Association <b>WC</b>	Margie Zelenak, PA Assisted Living Association <b>OC</b>
Jeffrey Iseman, PA SILC <b>OC</b>	Andrew Zwally, Greenlee Partners
Rebecca May-Cole, P4A <b>OC</b>	

OC = Outreach Committee; AC = Access Committee; QC = Quality Committee; WC = Workforce Committee

## Meeting Minutes

#	Discussion Items	Summary
1	<b>Welcome</b>	<p>Secretary of Aging Teresa Osborne welcomed everyone to the meeting, and Council Executive Director Chuck Quinnan explained the emergency evacuation protocol, as well as provided the following updates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Insurance Department Chief of Staff Alison Beam is Acting Insurance Commissioner Jessica Altman's designee on the Council.</li> <li>Pennsylvania Statewide Independent Living Council (PA SILC) Program Analyst Jeff Iseman resigned from the Outreach Committee as he is leaving the PA SILC to work at the PA Partnerships for Children.</li> </ul>
2	<b>Introduction of Members &amp; Guests</b>	<p>Members and guests introduced themselves.</p> <p>After the introductions, Secretary Osborne informed the Council members and guests about: 1) country-music legend Glen Campbell's documentary <i>I'll Be Me</i>, which documents his journey living with Alzheimer's disease before and throughout his farewell tour, and 2) the Pennsylvania Homecare Association's family caregiver resource <i>Secrets No One Told You About Family Caregiving</i>, which features tips, tricks, and helpful hints for caring for a loved one.</p>
3	<b>Approval of August 24, 2017 Meeting Minutes</b>	A motion was made, and the August 24, 2017 meeting minutes were unanimously approved.
4	<b>Commonwealth Updates</b>	<p>Secretary Osborne noted that Governor Wolf recently nominated Jennifer Smith, Dr. Rachel Levine, and Teresa Miller to officially lead the Departments of Drug and Alcohol Programs, Health, and Human Services, respectively, pending Senate confirmation.</p> <p>In recognition of the approaching one year anniversary of the Long-Term Care Council's first meeting, Secretary Osborne also reflected on the focus and mission of the Council and reiterated the commitment of her and her fellow cabinet colleagues to work inside and outside of unification in tandem with one another to coordinate, communicate, and collaborate the best use of the resources entrusted to them for the care of Pennsylvanians.</p>
5	<b>Community Health Choices Update</b>	<p>Jennifer Burnett, Deputy Secretary of the Department of Human Services Office of Long-Term Living, and Heather Hallman, Special Advisor to Acting Secretary of Human Services Teresa Miller, provided a PowerPoint presentation on Community Health Choices (CHC). The presentation included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>An overview of CHC, including who is and is not included and how the program works;</li> <li>Statistics on the CHC population;</li> <li>The goals of CHC;</li> <li>A comparison of fee-for-service versus managed care;</li> <li>The rationale for switching to managed care;</li> <li>Covered services;</li> <li>Continuity of care provisions;</li> <li>Screening and comprehensive needs assessment/reassessment requirements;</li> <li>Service coordination objectives;</li> </ul>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Priorities through implementation;</li> <li>• Launch indicators, including readiness review;</li> <li>• Communications to participants and providers;</li> <li>• Enrollment; and</li> <li>• Resource information.</li> </ul>
6	<b>Committee Updates</b>	<p>The below reports were provided on the Long-Term Care Council (LTCC) committees' initial conference calls regarding the LTCC's current priority: <i>recruitment and retention of direct care workers</i>.</p> <p><b>Outreach Committee</b> - Chair Ray Landis reported that the committee discussed its role and the role of the other committees in evaluating this priority. Specifically, Chair Landis said that the Outreach Committee discussed their role as that of determining the best way to translate the work products of the other committees into a clear and concise message that can be disseminated to the general public (including workers and potential workers), provider organizations, and government officials, as well as identifying ways to create greater awareness around this profession and the issues impacting it, etc.</p> <p><b>Access Committee</b> - Committee member Nicole Pruitt, who filled in for Chair Mike Sokoloski, reported that the committee discussed how to inform the public and potential direct care workers of the importance of choosing direct care work as a career path. She noted that the discussion turned to how to make the direct care field a priority career path and how to make the public aware of the issues surrounding recruitment and retention, etc., while dealing with the challenge of wages, including how to align this issue so wages are more attractive for workers yet affordable for providers. Ms. Pruitt also said the committee discussed examples of how some providers are currently tackling recruitment and retention issues in terms of training and education, noting that the committee looks forward to learning more about these efforts.</p> <p><b>Quality Committee</b> - Chair Kathleen Kleinmann reported that her committee was impressed by the existing information that is already available regarding the needs and issues of direct care workers and the systematic changes that are required to stimulate an environment that is conducive to keeping a workforce and attracting quality workers. Chair Kleinmann noted that the committee does not believe it could do better than what has already been recommended in the previous reports and studies conducted by various governor-appointed bodies. She said that they need to find out what, if anything, has been done with these recommendations so the committee can better understand their role.</p> <p><b>Workforce Committee</b> - Chair Matt Yarnell reiterated that his committee also does not want to reinvent the wheel as there has been a lot of important work already done over the last 17 years to help address recruitment and retention of direct care workers. Chair Yarnell said that instead of creating another report, they discussed the need to get updated facts and figures on the workforce, develop a problem statement based on the data, and come up with solutions to address these issues. He also noted that they need to figure out how get people to understand the need to invest in direct care workers by making it a profession and establishing pathways, as well as figuring out an agreed upon advocacy approach that can be used across the state to reach workers, providers, the general public, and lawmakers.</p>
7	<b>Working Lunch w/ Committee Breakout Meetings</b>	<p>The Outreach, Access, Quality, and Workforce committees met for a working lunch to continue discussing recruitment and retention of direct care workers, as well as a draft definition of direct care workers to the guide the work of the</p>

		Council and committees, needed workforce data, and resources/presentations that would be helpful moving forward.
8	<b>Committee Reports &amp; Council Discussion</b>	<p>The following reports were provided on the committee breakout meetings:</p> <p><b>Workforce Committee</b> - Chair Matt Yarnell provided the following report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The committee discussed the definition of direct care workers and felt it was an appropriate definition to guide the work of the committees and the Council.</li> <li>• While there is much work to be done, there is synergy around not recreating the wheel and figuring out how we get to the right questions, the right data, and the right narrative.</li> <li>• There is clear consensus from the 17 years' worth of reports regarding how to professionalize direct care workers, including standardized training, among other things.</li> <li>• It is important to understand the supply and demand and based on that data make a projection of what the need for direct care workers will be in the next 5, 10, 15 years. Other data that would be helpful to obtain includes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Turnover by different job classes of direct care workers</li> <li>○ Average hourly wages and median annual salaries by job class</li> <li>○ Number of direct care workers who rely on public assistance such as Medicaid</li> <li>○ Cost of living by county</li> <li>○ Updated financial impact data from the December 7, 2007 report <i>Addressing Pennsylvania's Direct Care Workforce Capacity: Primary Recommendations for Quality Jobs and Quality Care</i></li> </ul> </li> <li>• The committee also discussed guest speakers and presenters to bring before the Council to get a better sense of how other states are addressing recruitment and retention of these workers.</li> </ul> <p><b>Quality Committee</b> - Chair Kathleen Kleinmann provided the following report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The committee agrees with the definition of direct care workers.</li> <li>• Much of the discussion focused on the December 7, 2007 report <i>Addressing Pennsylvania's Direct Care Workforce Capacity: Primary Recommendations for Quality Jobs and Quality Care</i>, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Finding out what has been done as a result and whether any of this information is being used in the commonwealth's new work with managed care organizations, etc.</li> <li>○ Have any of the five immediate initiatives/recommendations in this report been implemented?</li> </ul> </li> <li>• The various reports and studies point to wages as one of the biggest issues facing direct care workers.</li> </ul> <p><b>Access Committee</b> - Nicole Pruitt provided the following report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The committee agrees with the definition of direct care workers.</li> <li>• Data that the committee believes would be helpful to review includes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ How people enter the direct care workforce?</li> <li>○ How many direct care workers are employed in the consumer-directed model?</li> <li>○ Wages and benefits (compared to other states)</li> <li>○ General demographic information, including age, gender, employment status, geographic location, etc.</li> <li>○ Comparison of wages and benefits of public sector versus private sector direct care workers</li> <li>○ How many direct care workers have more than one employer?</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Other resources the committee believes would be helpful include hearing directly from direct care workers as well as other employees who hire, supervise, train, or otherwise oversee the development of</li> </ul>

		<p>direct care workers, as well as getting an update on the Governor's 2015 Executive Order regarding direct care workers</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The committee also identified the following access issues: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Advertising to incoming workforce, including understanding generational differences</li> <li>○ Education on why the shortage of direct care workers has implications for the general public, etc.</li> <li>○ Laws and legal barriers regarding criminal histories</li> <li>○ Need for attracting more males to this line of work</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p><b>Outreach Committee</b> - Chair Ray Landis provided the following report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The committee was comfortable with the definition of direct care workers and discussed outreach by separating it into the following three categories: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) General public education about direct care workers and the need for direct care workers, the current shortage, and the projected future shortage</li> <li>2) Outreach directed at the direct care workforce and the potential direct care workforce, which includes raising the profile of the profession. Part of the discussion focused on where outreach should be directed. For example, should it be directed at high school students looking to get into the field, at foreign workers (e.g., creating a special visa category to address the immediate need), at groups inclined to service, etc. The idea of outreach at career fairs was also discussed as well as having someone from the Department of Education discuss what career and technical schools are doing now to encourage participation in this field.</li> <li>3) A clearinghouse of programs already in operation that other people might not be aware of – both for provider organizations (e.g., best practices and innovative approaches to recruitment and retention of direct care workers) and for direct care workers themselves (e.g., tips on what it takes to be a direct care worker and dealing with barriers of the job)</li> </ol> </li> <li>• As part of that discussion, we also considered that there are two big factors associated with outreach: 1) an immediate need for improvements to the direct care workforce, and 2) a need for growing the workforce 5, 10, 15 years from now as the demographic profile of Pennsylvania changes.</li> <li>• The committee also discussed possible presenters to speak about the direct care workforce, including how outreach might be done to individuals considering a career in this field, information on how other states are addressing recruitment and retention, and lessons from other occupations that have elevated their profession such as the nursing profession.</li> </ul>
9	<b>2018 Meeting Dates</b>	Chuck Quinnan reviewed the Council's 2018 meeting dates.
10	<b>Open Session &amp; Announcements</b>	<p>During the open session, Rebecca May-Cole from the PA Association of Area Agencies on Aging discussed the challenges of finding placements for inmates released from state correctional institutions who are care dependent. Secretary Osborne responded that this is an issue that is being worked on currently at the state level.</p> <p>Secretary Osborne reminded members that the Council's next meeting is scheduled for Thursday, December 7, 2017 at 10:00 a.m.</p>
11	<b>Adjournment</b>	The meeting was adjourned at 2:40 p.m.

**New Action Items**

#	Action Item	Actionee(s)	Deadline	Status
1	Obtain updated workforce data on direct care workers in Pennsylvania and information on initiatives in other states to improve recruitment and retention of these workers	Chuck Quinnan	ASAP	Pending
2	Status of the five immediate initiatives/recommendations in the December 7, 2007 report <i>Addressing Pennsylvania's Direct Care Workforce Capacity: Primary Recommendations for Quality Jobs and Quality Care</i>	Secretary Osborne & Chuck Quinnan	ASAP	Pending